



Navigation A B

Comparison of Navigation Overviews: Design A vs Design B

Design A (Separate UI concept)

Analysis:

Design A shows a complex navigation pattern with considerable branching and several failure points:

- **User Flow Complexity:** The flow diagram shows extensive branching starting from early steps, indicating users took many different paths through the prototype.
- **Success vs. Failure Rate:** There's a mix of green paths (successes) and red paths (unfinished missions), with red paths appearing throughout the user journey.
- **Problematic Areas:** The right section of the navigation overview (approximately Steps 19-24) shows almost entirely red paths, suggesting most users struggled to complete later tasks.
- **Consistency:** The navigation pattern appears inconsistent, with multiple parallel paths and several drop-off points.

Design B (Combined UI concept)

Analysis:

Design B shows a more streamlined navigation pattern with fewer branches and failure points:

- **User Flow Simplicity:** The flow is predominantly linear through the first 10 steps, with minimal branching until later stages.
- **Success Rate:** Green paths dominate throughout most of the journey, indicating higher task completion rates.
- **Problematic Areas:** Only a few red paths appear, primarily around Steps 10-11, suggesting a specific point of difficulty rather than widespread issues.
- **Consistency:** The navigation pattern is more consistent and predictable, with clearer expected paths.

Comparative Insights:

1. **Overall Usability:** Design B appears to have significantly better usability with more successful task completions and fewer alternative paths.
2. **User Confidence:** The linear flow in Design B suggests users understood where to go next, while the branching in Design A indicates uncertainty or confusion.
3. **Task Completion:** Design B has fewer red paths, suggesting higher completion rates compared to Design A which shows extensive failure paths, especially in later steps.
4. **Navigation Efficiency:** Design B has a more direct path from start to finish with fewer detours, indicating a more efficient user experience.
5. **Problem Areas:**
 - Design A: Issues throughout the flow, with severe problems in later steps
 - Design B: Isolated issues around Steps 10-11, but generally cleaner flow

Based on these navigation overviews, Design B (Combined UI) demonstrates superior usability with a clearer user flow, higher success rates, and fewer points of user confusion compared to Design A (Separated UI).